OXFORD

UNIVERSITY PRESS

Great Clarendon Street, Oxford, OX2 6DP, United Kingdom

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford. It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship, and education by publishing worldwide. Oxford is a registered trade mark of Oxford University Press in the UK and in certain other countries

UNU-WIDER, Katajanokanlaituri, 6B, 00160 Helsinki, Finland

The moral rights of the authors have been asserted

First Edition published in 2018

Impression:1

Some rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, for commercial purposes without the prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press.



This is an open access publication. Except where otherwise noted, this work is distributed under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-Non Commercial-Share Alike 3.0 IGO licence (CC BY-NC-SA 3.0 IGO), a copy of which is available at https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/igo/.

Enquiries concerning use outside the terms of the Creative Commons licence should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the above address or to academic.permissions@oup.com.

Published in the United States of America by Oxford University Press 198 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016, United States of America

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data Data available

Library of Congress Control Number: 2018940940

ISBN 978-0-19-882959-1

Printed and bound by CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CRO 4YY

Links to third party websites are provided by Oxford in good faith and for information only. Oxford disclaims any responsibility for the materials contained in any third party website referenced in this work.

Contents

List of Figures	xi
List of Tables	xiii
List of Abbreviations	xvii
Notes on Contributors	xix
1. Introduction Siwan Anderson, Lori Beaman, and Jean-Philippe Platteau	1
Part I. Marriage	
2. Marital Trajectories, Women's Autonomy, and Women's Well-Being in Senegal Sylvie Lambert, Dominique van de Walle, and Paola Villar	17
3. Making Marriages Last: Trust is Good, But Credible Information is Better Rebecca L. Thornton and Hans-Peter Kohler	53
4. Intra-Household Bargaining in Poor Countries Jean-Marie Baland and Roberta Ziparo	69
5. Forced Migration and Attitudes Towards Domestic Violence: Evidence from Turkey Selim Gulesci	97
6. Bride Price and the Well-Being of Women Sara Lowes and Nathan Nunn	117
Part II. Outside Options	
7. Reducing Early Pregnancy in Low-Income Countries: A Literature Review and New Evidence Lars Ivar Oppedal Berge, Kjetil Bjorvatn, Amina Mohamed Maalim, Vincent Compille, and Portil Typegadden.	e 141

Contents

8. Breaking the Metal Ceiling: Female Entrepreneurs who Succeed in Male-Dominated Sectors Francisco Campos, Markus Goldstein, Laura McGorman, Ana Maria Munoz Boudet, and Obert Pimhidzai	167
9. Career Dynamics and Gender Gaps Among Employees in the Microfinance Sector <i>Ina Ganguli, Ricardo Hausmann, and Martina Viarengo</i>	192
10. Why Do Women Co-Operate More in Women's Groups? James Fearon and Macartan Humphreys	217
11. The Impact of Social Mobilization on Health Service Delivery and Health Outcomes: Evidence from Rural Pakistan <i>Xavier Giné, Salma Khalid, and Ghazala Mansuri</i>	237
Part III. Laws and Cultural Norms	
12. Governance and the Reversal of Women's Rights: The Case of Abortion in El Salvador <i>Jocelyn Viterna, José Santos Guardado Bautista, Silvia Ivette Juarez Barrios, and Alba Evelyn Cortez</i>	255
13. Gender, Islam, and Law <i>John R. Bowen</i>	277
14. The Effect of China's One Child Policy on Sex Selection, Family Size, and the School Enrolment of Daughters Nancy Qian	296
15. Eradicating Women-Hurting Customs: What Role for Social Engineering? <i>Jean-Philippe Platteau, Giulia Camilotti, and Emmanuelle Auriol</i>	319
16. Are Caste Categories Misleading? The Relationship Between Gender and Jati in Three Indian States Shareen Joshi, Nishtha Kochhar, and Vijayendra Rao	357
17. Excess Female Mortality in Africa Siwan Anderson and Debraj Ray	384
Index	403

Notes on Contributors

Siwan Anderson is a Professor at the Vancouver School of Economics at the University of British Columbia, Canada. She is currently associate editor of the *Journal of Development Economics*, the *Review of Economics and Statistics*, and the *Journal of Globalization and Development*. She is a fellow of the Canadian Institute for Advanced Research (CIFAR).

Emmanuelle Auriol is a professor at Toulouse School of Economics. She is a fellow of the EEA, CEPR, EUDN, and CESifo and an editor of international academic journals. Over the years, she has received several grants and awards for her research, which is published in top international journals. She relies both on theory and empirical studies to derive policy recommendations in industrial organization, behavioural economics and development economics. Her research has also been featured in articles in journals as well as on television and radio.

Jean-Marie Baland is a Professor of Economics at the Department of Economics of the University of Namur. His research interests include the analysis of informal institutions in less developed economies, the determinants of deforestation and the consequences of poverty. Current research projects include the determinants of early mortality in South Asia and the definition of new poverty measures allowing for early mortality as a measure of serious deprivation.

Lori Beaman is an Associate Professor of Economics at Northwestern University. A development economist working on microeconomic issues, Lori's research interests are centred on two themes: social networks and gender. She is also an affiliate of the National Bureau of Economic Research (NBER), the Abdul Latif Jameel Poverty Action Lab (J-PAL).

Kjetil Bjorvatn is a Professor of Economics at NHH Norwegian School of Economics. His main research interests are in the fields of economic development and behavioural economics. He has published a number of articles in these areas, focusing on microfinance, entrepreneurship, and education.

John R. Bowen is Dunbar-Van Cleve Professor in Arts and Sciences at Washington University in St. Louis. He has been studying Islam and society in Indonesia since the late 1970s, and since 2001 has worked in Western Europe and North America on problems of pluralism, law, and religion, and in particular on contemporary efforts to rethink Islamic norms and civil law. Awarded a Guggenheim prize in 2012 and named a Carnegie Fellow in 2016, Professor Bowen has also served as a recurrent Visiting Professor at the London School of Economics.

Giulia Camilotti completed her PhD at the University of Namur. Her research interests include the economics of gender and the theoretical and empirical investigation of social norms.

Francisco Campos is a Senior Economist for the World Bank's Finance, Competitiveness and Innovation Global Practice. He's also Thematic Leader on Gender and Entrepreneurship for the World Bank's Africa Region Gender Innovation Lab. Francisco's main areas of expertise are linked to entrepreneurship, MSMEs, competitiveness, financial inclusion, and gender. He leads private sector development projects in fragile countries in Africa and various research studies on entrepreneurship. Prior to joining the World Bank, he held positions in a number of organizations on investment promotion and investment management.

Alba Evelyn Cortez is a Salvadoran lawyer, notary, university instructor, and human rights trainer. An expert in human rights, criminal law, and anti-discrimination law based on sex, she has authored thirteen publications on the rights of women to a life free from violence and discrimination. Currently, she is the academic coordinator of the training school of UDEMAS (the Union of Salvadoran Women Lawyers).

James D. Fearon is Geballe Professor in the School of Humanities and Sciences at Stanford University, Senior Fellow at Stanford's Freeman-Spogli Institute for International Studies, and a Program Member with the Canadian Institute for Advanced Research. His research focuses primarily on the causes and consequences of political violence.

Ina Ganguli is an Assistant Professor of Economics at the University of Massachusetts Amherst. Her primary research areas are labour economics and the economics of science and innovation. Her recent research has focused on the migration of high-skill workers, gender disparities in the labour market, and the formation of scientific collaborations. She is also an affiliated faculty at the Stockholm Institute of Transition Economics (SITE) at the Stockholm School of Economics, and a Fellow at the Institute for Quantitative Social Sciences at Harvard University. She holds a PhD from Harvard University.

Xavier Giné is a Lead Economist in the Finance and Private Sector Development Team of the Development Research Group at the World Bank. Since joining the World Bank, his research has focused on access to financial services and community driven development. Prior to joining the Bank, he was a postdoctoral fellow and lecturer at the Economic Growth Center at Yale University. He holds a BA in Economics from Universitat Pompeu Fabra in Spain, an MA and a PhD in Economics from the University of Chicago.

Markus Goldstein is a Lead Economist in the Office of the Chief Economist for Africa at the World Bank, where he heads the Africa Gender Innovation Lab. His research centres around issues of gender and land, firms, property rights, and youth employment.

José Santos Guardado Bautista is a Salvadoran lawyer, notary, researcher, and regular contributor to the Salvadoran law journal *Enfoque Jurídico*. His publications focus primarily on topics of human rights and gender. Currently, he works in the Crimes Against the Administration of Justice Unit in the Fiscalía General (Attorney General's Office) of El Salvador.

Selim Gulesci is an Assistant Professor at the Department of Economics, Bocconi University. He obtained his PhD from London School of Economics in 2011. His research is related to microeconomics of development with a focus on microenterprise growth; and the relationship between gender norms and human capital in developing countries.

Ricardo Hausmann is Director of Harvard University, Center for International Development and Professor of the Practice of Economic Development at the Harvard Kennedy School. Previously, he served as the first Chief Economist of the Inter-American Development Bank, where he created the Research Department. He served as Minister of Planning of Venezuela and as a member of the Board of the Central Bank of Venezuela. He holds a PhD from Cornell University.

Macartan Humphreys is a Professor at the Department of Political Science at Columbia University and director of the Institutions and Political Inequality unit at the WZB Berlin Social Science Center. His research focuses on the political economy of development, political accountability, and conflict processes.

Shareen Joshi is an Assistant Professor of International Development at Georgetown University. Her research focuses on gender, human capital, and political economy issues at the grassroots level. She has published in economics, demography, development studies, and South Asian studies.

Silvia Ivette Juarez Barrios is a Salvadoran lawyer, notary, and researcher with extensive experience drafting legislation that supports women's human rights and development. She currently coordinates the Program for a Life Without Violence for Women within the feminist organization ORMUSA.

Salma Khalid is an economist at the International Monetary Fund, Washington DC. Her research is in development microeconomics and behavioural and experimental economics, with a focus on factors influencing individual health seeking behaviours and health outcomes.

Nishtha Kochhar is a graduate student at the Department of Economics, Georgetown University. She has also worked as a research consultant with the Development Research Group at the World Bank. Her research interests include the microeconomics of gender, social networks, intra-household dynamics, and evolution of political institutions.

Hans-Peter Kohler is the Frederick J. Warren Professor of Demography in the Department of Sociology and a Research Associate in the Population Studies Center at the University of Pennsylvania. His primary research focuses on fertility and health in developing and developed countries. He has published widely on topics related to fertility, health, social and sexual networks, HIV/AIDS, biodemography, and wellbeing in leading scientific journals, and his work has had substantial influence on policy and media discussions related to demographic change.

Sylvie Lambert is a Professor at the Paris School of Economics and senior research fellow at INRA, Paris, France. Her research is centred on household and family economics in developing countries. Most of her work concerns the sub-Saharan African context, where she collected several household surveys. She holds a Master's in Economics

and a PhD in Economics from Ecole des Hautes Etudes en Sciences Sociales, Paris, France. She teaches Development Economics in the PSE master programmes.

Sara Lowes is an Assistant Professor of Economics at Bocconi University. Her research interests are at the intersection of development economics, political economy, and economic history. Her research examines how understanding history and culture can inform development policy. Most recently, she has been working in the Democratic Republic of Congo.

Ghazala Mansuri is a Lead Economist in the Poverty and Equity Global Practice and the Development Research Group at the World Bank. She has published extensively in leading journals in economics and development, including the *American Economic Review*, the *Review of Economic Studies*, the *American Economic Journal: Applied*, and the *Journal of Development Economics*. She has also co-authored the book *Localizing Development: Does Participation Work?* Her research spans five broad areas: poverty, inequality and mobility, rural development, the economics of household behavior, the political economy of participatory development, and institutional and governance reforms for development. She holds a PhD in economics from Boston University.

Laura McGorman is a Public Policy Research Manager at Facebook, where she currently focuses on research related to Facebook's impact on the economy and the use of digital tools by small and medium enterprises. Prior to joining Facebook, Laura held positions at the US Department of Commerce, Opower, Harvard Business School, the World Bank, and USAID. She has a Bachelor's in Economics from Columbia University and a Master's in International Development from the Harvard Kennedy School of Government

Amina Mohamed Maalim worked as a research assistant at The Choice Lab, NHH Norwegian School of Economics, and on the Girls' Empowerment project in Tanzania. Her Master thesis used qualitative data from the research project to study effects of business and health interventions on the development of business plans and empowerment.

Ana Maria Munoz Boudet is a Senior Social Scientist in the World Bank's Poverty and Equity Global Practice. She has worked on gender, poverty, and inequality issues in Latin America and the Caribbean, Europe and Central Asia, and Africa. She is a co-author of the *World Development Report 2012* on Gender Equality and Development. She holds a master's degree from the London School of Economics and doctorate studies from the University College of London.

Nathan Nunn is the Frederic E. Abbe Professor of Economics at Harvard University. He works within the fields of development economics, political economy, and economic history. He has undertaken extensive research on gender-related issues, both within Africa and globally. In addition, he has also researched a number of topics within the context of the Democractic Republic of the Congo.

Lars Ivar Oppedal Berge is an Associate Professor at NHH Norwegian School of Economics. Berge's research has focused on entrepreneurship, firm growth, and microfinance using various forms of experimental methods. His work has appeared in *Management Science* and in the *Journal of Economic Behavior and Organization*. Berge is also affiliated to the Chr. Michelsen Institute (CMI) and to the Choice Lab at NHH.

Obert Pimhidzai is a Senior Economist at the Poverty and Equity Global Practice of the World Bank, leading the Practice's work programme in Cambodia, Lao PDR, and Vietnam. Since joining the World Bank in 2009, Obert has worked in Kenya, Uganda, Mongolia, and Nigeria, focusing on poverty measurement and monitoring, poverty diagnostics, and undertaking service delivery assessments and resource tracking surveys. His current research focus is on ethnic minorities' poverty, distributional effects of fiscal policy, welfare impact of infrastructure investments, and mobility in the non-farm self-employment sector. He has a PhD in Economics from the University of Cape Town.

Jean-Philippe Platteau is author of several books and numerous academic articles. He has devoted his whole research career to studying the role of institutions in development and the processes of institutional change. The influence of non-economic factors and frontier issues at the interface between economics and sociology are a central focus of his work. Recently, he has been interested in the effects of family structures, customary norms, and religion. A central concern is how these can be possibly transformed, or perverted, through public action, political forces, and market development. Effects on women have received particular attention.

Nancy Qian is Professor of Managerial and Decision Sciences at Northwestern University's Kellogg School of Management. Her research uses empirical evidence to understand the role of demographic change, geography, and institutions in long-run economic development and growth.

Vijayendra Rao is a Lead Economist in the Development Economics Research Group at the World Bank. His research integrates his training in economics with theory and methods from anthropology and political science. He has published widely in the fields of development economics, development studies, and deliberative democracy.

Debraj Ray is Julius Silver Professor of the Faculty of Arts and Science and Professor of Economics at New York University. He is co-editor at the *American Economic Review* and a research associate of the National Bureau of Economic Research. He is a part-time Professor at the University of Warwick and research affiliate of the Instituto de Analisis Economico (CSIC) in Barcelona.

Vincent Somville is an Assistant Professor at NHH Norwegian School of Economics and an Associated Senior Researcher at Chr. Michelsen Institute. His is a development economist with two main overlapping research agendas, one in health and the other in finance and entrepreneurship. He is currently working in Tanzania on result-based financing of the health sector and on young women's health and entrepreneurship. He is also leading a project about banking and microfinance in India.

Rebecca L. Thornton is an Associate Professor in the Department of Economics at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign. Her research focuses on health, education, and the status of women in developing countries. Across these topics, her work addresses core issues within Economics, including the role of subjective beliefs in decision-making and how social networks influence behaviour and beliefs.

Bertil Tungodden is a Professor at the Department of Economics, NHH Norwegian School of Economics, where he is the Director of the Research Center of Excellence—FAIR—and the founder of The Choice Lab. He is also an Associated Senior Researcher

at Chr. Michelsen Institute. His research interests are experimental and behavioural economics, development economics, distributive justice, and social choice theory. He has published extensively in international academic journals in economics and philosophy.

Dominique van de Walle is a Lead Economist in the World Bank's Development Research Group. Her research interests are in the general area of poverty, vulnerability, gender and public policy, encompassing social protection, safety nets, and impact evaluation. Much of her recent research has been on Vietnam, South Asia, and sub-Saharan Africa. She holds a Master's in Economics from the London School of Economics and a PhD in Economics from the Australian National University, and began her career at the Bank as a member of the core team that produced the *1990 World Development Report on Poverty*.

Martina Viarengo is a Professor in the Department of Economics of the Graduate Institute of International and Development Studies of Geneva and a Faculty Associate at Harvard University, Center for International Development. Previously, she was an economist at the Centre for Economic Performance of the London School of Economics and a Postdoctoral Fellow at the Harvard University, John F. Kennedy School of Government. Her research areas include comparative public policy, international migration and the social dimensions of development. She holds a PhD from the London School of Economics.

Paola Villar is a Lead Economist in the World Bank's Development Research Group. Her research interests are in the general area of poverty, vulnerability, gender, and public policy, encompassing social protection, safety nets, and impact evaluation. Much of her recent past research has been on Vietnam, South Asia, and sub-Saharan Africa. She holds a Master's in Economics from the London School of Economics and a PhD in Economics from the Australian National University, and began her career at the Bank as a member of the core team that produced the 1990 World Development Report on Poverty.

Jocelyn Viterna is Professor of Sociology at Harvard University. She has published widely in the fields of development, gender, and social mobilization. Her current project investigates the recent reversal of abortion rights in Central America, and its consequences for women's health and freedom.

Roberta Ziparo is an Assistant Professor at the Aix-Marseille School of Economics of the Aix-Marseille University since 2015. Her primary research interests include development, household, health economics, and microeconomic theory. Applying both theoretical and empirical tools, she studies the interaction of agents within groups and micro-institutions in general, with a special focus on the household and the family.

Reducing Early Pregnancy in Low-Income Countries

A Literature Review and New Evidence

Lars Ivar Oppedal Berge, Kjetil Bjorvatn, Amina Mohamed Maalim, Vincent Somville, and Bertil Tungodden¹

1. Background

My first priority in life is to educate myself and, once I do, I will use my education to prevent cruel practices that other girls are being subjected to such as child marriage, circumcision and arranged marriages... Since I started Form one, it was very difficult for my parents to pay my fees or buy school uniform. I have many problems that bother me, for instance I am completing Form four and to date my parents have not paid the school fees. Sometimes when I go back home, I often cry. Therefore, I would like to say that I have many aspirations in life. However, I feel that I will not be successful due to the difficulties I am encountering... I do not have much more to say but I do have one worry. I would like you to give me advice. Once I finish school, what should I do in order to avoid the pressures of unwanted pregnancy and the expectation of early marriage?

Adolescent girl, Morogoro region of Tanzania

¹ We would like to thank Femina Hip for excellent cooperation throughout the research project. In addition, we would like to thank Katanta Simwanza and Goodluck Charles for their assistance in developing the training material. We would also like to thank Tausi Kida and Linda Helgesson Sekei for their invaluable contributions in designing and implementing the research project. Special thanks for first-rate research assistance to Juda Lyamai. Finally, we would like to thank the editor, Jean-Philippe Platteau, Markus Goldstein, and participants in the UNU-WIDER Gender and Development Conference at Namur University for excellent comments and suggestions. We have received financial support from the Research Council of Norway, The Royal Norwegian Embassy in Tanzania, NHH Norwegian School of Economics, and the Chr. Michelsen Institute. The project has been administered by The Choice Lab.

This quote is from one of the participants in a research project on female empowerment that we conducted in Tanzania, and on which we will have more to say later in the chapter. It illustrates the challenges facing many adolescent girls in low-income countries, where early pregnancy and lifelong dependence upon family and partners threaten both their social and economic development.² In Tanzania, by the age of nineteen, more than 40 per cent of the girls have had their first child (data from the 2015–16 Tanzania District health survey).

Early pregnancies are generally associated with negative effects on women's health and education (Goldin & Katz 2002; Rasul 2008), as well as their economic achievement (Bailey 2006; Miller 2010). Early pregnancies are also associated with poor health outcomes for the child: children born to adolescent mothers generally have lower birth weight, and the risk of being still born or dying in the first weeks is 50 per cent higher when the mother is under 20 years old than when she is 20–29 years old (World Health Organization 2014).

It is therefore of great importance to understand which interventions are effective in delaying pregnancies among adolescent girls in developing countries, and the present chapter offers a review of the rich set of interventions that have been studied in the literature. In this review, we offer a novel approach to evaluating these types of interventions by distinguishing interventions that target girls' *mindset* (preferences and beliefs) from those that relieve constraints and expand girls' set of economic *opportunities*. The underlying idea is that early pregnancies may reflect both a certain mindset and a lack of alternatives. Changing the mindset, for instance by making girls more aware of the risks of early pregnancy or increasing their locus of control, can take place through education, as illustrated by the following statement by an adolescent girl in the Morogoro region of Tanzania, reflecting on a training programme on reproductive health:

I have received training on fertility and health and been taught how to say no when a man asks you to have sex with him. You should have a firm stand in saying no and not fear him and start to bite your nails or dig your foot into the ground. You have to stare at him in the face and be serious. All the girls should receive education on how to say no.

On the other hand, girls may also delay pregnancies if they have greater economic opportunities, as a result of either cash transfers or vocational or entrepreneurship training programmes, as illustrated by the following statement by another adolescent participant in our research project:

 $^{^2}$ In the age group 15–19 years, the fertility rate is 108 per 1,000 women in sub-Saharan Africa compared with 25 per 1,000 women in the OECD (data.worldbank.org).

In August, I received training on entrepreneurship, which has enabled me to understand the opportunities available to me as a girl... After the training, I became more informed on how to start my own business, which will make me work hard for my future. In the next 5 years, I will have a huge business, which I know will bring in income. After completing my education, my life will be based in Morogoro. I do not expect to have children during this time until when I am employed or running my own business that will bring in income and independence from anyone else.

The quote reveals that the entrepreneurship training programme may not only expand girls' economic opportunities, but also changed their mindset, in the sense that they become more future orientation and independent. Hence, as will be illustrated throughout this chapter, there is not always a sharp distinction between field interventions that aim to change the mindset and field interventions that aim to improve the opportunities of adolescent girls; often they do both.

The most common approach to addressing early pregnancies has been to target the mindset dimension by providing adolescent girls with health and family planning information, sometimes combined with initiatives to improve access to contraceptives. But more recently, there has been a greater focus on expanding economic opportunities, in the form of both conditional cash grants and entrepreneurship training programmes. The increased focus on economic opportunities is also reflected in policy circles. For example, the WHO stresses the importance of improving economic opportunities and increasing the negotiation and life skills of adolescent girls to allow them to make safer sexual decisions and avoid unwanted sex.³

This chapter is divided into two parts. In the first part, we survey the literature on field interventions targeting early pregnancies and risky sexual behaviour. We limit ourselves to research on low-income countries from this century and to studies that include evidence on adolescents, which we define as people below eighteen years of age. We organize the survey in three sections: (i) interventions targeting mindset; (ii) interventions creating economic opportunities; (iii) interventions that target both dimensions. Recent reviews, which include evidence from high-income countries, consistently conclude that interventions that combine sexual education and improved access to contraceptives give better results than single interventions (Oringanje et al. 2016; The World Bank 2012). We argue in this chapter that even those combined interventions do not lead to clear and consistent results and that increasing economic opportunities, perhaps in tandem with health training, may be needed.

 $^{^3}$ See World Health Organization on Gender: http://www.searo.who.int/entity/gender/en/(accessed 6 June 2017).

The second part of the chapter reports from a randomized control trial (RCT) that we are currently conducting in rural Tanzania with adolescent girls, and from which the above quotes are taken. We show how health training and entrepreneurship training have affected both the mindset, through an increase in the locus of control, and the economic opportunities of the girls, through making them more interested in starting their own business. In the analysis of this RCT, we move beyond studying responses to survey questions by conducting a text analysis of more than 3,000 essays written by adolescent girls about their hopes for the future. A weakness in the literature is the lack of evidence on the mechanisms through which the interventions work, and we believe that text analysis represents an innovative and promising tool for attaining a better understanding of how such interventions shape the mindset and behaviour of adolescent girls.

2. Literature

In this section, we review thirty papers that differ in several dimensions, such as context (countries and time), sample characteristics (gender, age), and research design (difference-in-difference, randomized control trials). Table 7.1 provides an overview of the papers, organized by the nature of the intervention (affecting mindset, economic opportunities, or both) and ordered by publication date. For each paper, the table provides the reference, a description of the interventions (type, country, year), the method, and the main impacts.

2.1. Changing the Mindset

The provision of health-related information, including family planning information, has traditionally been the most common method of reducing both early pregnancies and risky sexual behaviour. Some of these interventions focus on providing basic knowledge, assuming the targeted girls lack an understanding of both how to protect themselves against pregnancy and how STIs are transmitted.⁴ Other studies address the social dimension, for instance by considering the impact of teaching abstinence until marriage.

We discuss the impact of the different interventions in three dimensions: knowledge and attitudes, sexual behaviour, and pregnancies. Overall, the

⁴ Note the difference between 'STI' (sexual transmittable *infection*) and STD (sexual transmittable *disease*). Depending on the strain of the bacteria, virus, or protozoa, infections can (but may not always) cause a disease. Therefore, not all STIs cause STDs, but an STD is classified as an STI (https://www.medinstitute.org/2011/11/std-sti-sti-std-whats-the-difference/, accessed 31 March 2017).

Paper	Intervention	Country (time) Sample	Sample	Method	Main results
Mindset					
Eggleston et al. 2000	Health information in schools (promotion of both abstinence and safer sex)	Jamaica (1995–1997)	945 girls/boys Age: 11–14	ΟiΟ	After one year: - Almost no impact on reproductive health knowledge - No impact on attitudes towards sexual activity - No impact on contraceptive use
Kim et al. 2001	Multimedia campaign to promote sexual responsibility and increase reproductive health services by training providers	Zimbabwe (1997–1998)	1,400 women/men DiD (control site Age: 10–24 partly exposed to intervention)	DiD (control site partly exposed to intervention)	 Little impact on general reproductive health knowledge Positive impact on 'saying no to sex', abstinence, 'avoiding sugar daddies'
Magnani R.J. et al. 2001	School- and health-clinic-based adolescent reproductive health initiative: - Training courses for health workers in reproductive health services for adolescents - School sexual and reproductive health education curriculum	Brazil (1997–1999)	4,777 women/men DiD Age: 11–19	DiD	- No impact on sexual or contraceptive-use behaviour - No impact on use of public clinics
Agha 2002	Subsidized condoms and promoting the use of condoms (peer educators, youth clubs, media campaigns)	Cameroon, Botswana, South Africa, Guinea (1994–1998)	Cameroon: 1,606 women/men Age: 12–22 South Africa: 221 women/men Age: 17–20 Botswana: 1,002 (increased to 2,396 at follow-up) women/men Age: 13–18 Guinea: 2016 women/men	QiQ	- Ambiguous effects on perceptions and beliefs, improving some but not others - Ambiguous effects on number of partners and condom use, with some significant impact on some of the indicators in some of the countries

Table 7.1. Continued

Paper	Intervention	Country (time) Sample	Sample	Method	Main results
Okonofua et al. 2003	Community participation, peer education, public lectures, health clubs in schools, and training of STD treatment providers The treatment is compared to a control with no intervention	Nigeria (1997–1998)	1,896 women/men RCT in 12 Age: 14–20 schools (4 treated control)	RCT in 12 schools (4 treated 8 control)	- Improvements in knowledge of STDs, condom use, awareness that the partner had an STD and STD treatment-seeking behaviour
Lou CH. et al. 2004	Build awareness and offer counselling and services related to sexuality and reproduction	China (2000–2001)	2,227 women/men DiD Age: 15–24	DiD	- Increase in condom use
Tu et al. 2008	Tu et al. 2008 Follow-up to Lou et al. 2004.	China (2000–2001)			- No long-term impacts
Agha & Van Rossem 2004	Peer sexual health education intervention in secondary schools The treatment is compared to a control with no intervention	Zambia (2000–2001)	416 women/men Age: 14–23	RCT (3 treated schools, 2 control)	 Positive changes in normative beliefs about abstinence Reductions in multiple regular partnerships No change in condom use
Cabezón et al. 2005	TeenStar' abstinence-centred sex education programme The treatment is compared to a control with no intervention	Chile (1996–1997)	1,259 girls Age: 15–16	RCT	- Reduced pregnancies
Magnani R. et al. 2005	Life skills education programme for all students in middle and secondary schools	South Africa (1999)	2,222 women/men Age: 14–24	Observational/IV	Age: 14–24 Age: 14–24 Age: 16–24 Age: 16–24 Age: 16–24 Age: 16–24 Age: 16–24 Age: 17–24
Cartagena et al. 2006	Sexual health peer education	Mongolia (2004)	1,367 women/men Observational Age: 15–19	Observational	- Increase in knowledge, reduction in traditional attitudes, and greater awareness of self-efficacy regarding HIV and sexual health - No increase in likelihood of practising safe sex

	des, on	n ge des ted ific		ou
 No effect on condom use Improved knowledge of HIV in both intervention groups Improved knowledge of emergency contraception in corresponding group Reported sexual behaviour similar in the intervention and control groups 	Significant impact on knowledge, attitudes, and reported sexually transmitted infection symptoms No consistent impact on biological outcomes	Clear and consistent beneficial impact on sexual and reproductive health knowledge Generally no significant impact on attitudes to sexual risk, pregnancies, or other reported sexual behaviours, except for some specific outcomes and sub-groups of subjects	- Increased contraceptive use	 Risk info: 28 per cent decrease in teen pregnancy Official abstinence-only HIV curriculum: no impact on teen pregnancy
No effect Improved intervent Improved Contrace Reported	Significant and reporte symptoms No consiste outcomes	Clear and sexual ar Generally to sexual be sexual be outcome	Increased	Risk info: 2 pregnancy Official abs impact on
1 1 1 1	1	1 1	1	
Ister RCT	⊢	⊢	0	F
JO L	RCT S	RCT	DiD	RCT
10,954 students ir 40 schools Age: 15–18	9,645 adolescents in 20 communities Age: 12–19 (a few above 19)	13,814 women/ men Age: 15–30	1,995 women Age: <25	2,422 girls/boys Age: 13–17
Mexico(2001) 10,954 students in Cluster RCT 40 schools Age: 15–18	Tanzania 9 (1998) ir (1998) A A a a	Tanzania 1 (1998) π Α	India (2002–2004) A	(2003–2005) A
The intervention had three arms: - HIV prevention course that promoted condom use - The same course with emergency contraception as back-up - The existing sex education course (control)	The intervention had four components: - Community activities - Teacher-led, peer-assisted sexual health education in years 5–7 of primary school - Training and supervision of health workers to provide 'youth-friendly' sexual health services - Peer condom social marketing The treatment is compared to a control with no intervention	Follow-up to Ross et al. 2007	- Promoting delaying birth of first child until the mother is 21, and birth of second child until 36 months after first birth - Promoting contraception	Four groups: - (a) Providing information on the relative risk of HIV infection by partner's age - (b) The government's official abstinence-only HIV curriculum - (a) and (b) combined - No intervention
Walker et al. 2006	Ross et al. 2007	Doyle et al. 2010	Daniel et al. 2008	Dupas 2011

Table 7.1. Continued

Paper	Intervention	Country (time) Sample	Sample	Method	Main results
Dupas et al. 2017	Four groups: - Teacher training on the regular HIV prevention curriculum - 60-minute session on the regular HIV prevention curriculum delivered by an outside consultant - 60-minute session on the regular HIV prevention curriculum delivered by an outside consultant + 'Sugar Daddy Risk Awareness' information from Dupas (2011) - Control group without interventions	(2010–2011)	3,154 girls from 318 schools Age: 15 on average	RCT	- Childbearing reduced by 25–48 per cent in all treatments
Opportunities	8				
Stecklov et al. 2007	CCT (conditional on children enrolling in and attending school and that family members obtain health care)	Honduras (2000–2002) Nicaragua (2000–2002) Mexico (1998–2003)	Honduras: 1,997 women Nicaragua: 2,000 women Mexico: 2,000 women Age: 12-47	DiD	- Honduras: CCT increased fertility (eligibility criteria incentivized childbearing) - No significant impacts in the other two countries
Feldman et al. 2009	Oportunidades Mexico Compared to no intervention	Mexico (1998–2003)	8,568 women Age: 15–49	RCT	- No effect on contraceptive use or birth spacing
Baird et al. 2010	CCT Zomba (conditional on school attendance) Compared to no transfers	Malawi (2007–2008)	3,805 women Age: 13–22	RCT	 Significant declines in early marriage, teenage pregnancy, and self-reported sexual activity
Alam et al. 2011	The Punjab Female School Stipend Programme: - Female CCT Compared to no stipend	Pakistan (2003–2009)	4,000 women Age: 12–19	RD DiD	- No effect on marriage delays or births

2011	- UCT - CCT (conditional on school attendance) - No transfers	(2008–2010)	Age: 13–22	- -	substantially lower in the UCT than the CCT group, entirely due to the impact of UCTs on these outcomes among girls who dropped out of school
de Walque et al. 2012	CCT (conditional on negative STD test) Two treatments: - Low-value transfer - High-value transfer The study also includes a control group without transfers	Tanzania (2010–2011)	10 villages, 2,399 of Age: 18–30	RCT	 High-value transfer reduced STD prevalence, directly measured using biological samples.
Jensen 2012	Three years of recruiting services to help young women in randomly selected rural Indian villages to get jobs in the business process outsourcing industry The treated villages are compared to control villages without recruiting services	India (2003–2006)	3,200 households, Age: 15–21	RCT at village level	- Women from treatment villages 5–6 percentage points less likely to get married or to have given birth over the three-year period of the intervention
Handa et al. 2014	UCT of US\$20 per month. The treatment is compared to a control with no transfers	Kenya	1,433 women and men Age: 15–25	RCT	 Delay in age of sexual debut No effect on HIV-risk-related behaviours such as condom use, number of partners and transactional sex
Heath & Mobarak 2015	Compare girls and boys living in villages that have gained, or have not gained, access to garment factories	Bangladesh (1980–2014)	30,180 women	DiD	- Women exposed to the garment sector delay marriage and childbirth
Mindset & Opportunities	pportunities				
Bandiera et al. 2015	Vocational training and information on reproductive health in youth clubs The treatment is compared to a control with no intervention	Uganda (2008–2012)	5,000 girls Age: 14–20	RCT	 Increased likelihood of girls engaging in income-generating activities (driven by increased self-employment) Increased private consumption Decrease in teen pregnancy and early entry into marriage/cohabitation Drop in share of girls reporting sex against their will

Table 7.1. Continued

Paper	Intervention	Country (time) Sample	Sample	Method	Main results
Buehren et al. 2015	Vocational training and information on reproductive health in youth clubs, combined with microfinance services	Tanzania (2009–2011)	150 villages	RCT	- No significant impact on childbearing, or other outcomes related to sexual behaviour
Duflo et al. 2015	The study has four components: - Education subsidies - Abstinence curriculum - Education subsidies and abstinence curriculum - Control group with no particular intervention	Kenya (2003–2010)	328 schools Age: average at baseline 13.5 years	RCT	Education subsidy programme: - Statistically significantly reduced teen pregnancy rate (from 16 to 13 per cent) No impact on HSV-2 prevalence Abstinence curriculum alone: - No impact Combined treatment: - Reduction in both fertility and HSV-2 infection
Buchmann et al. 2016	The study has four components: - (a) Empowerment programme - (b) Financial incentive to delay marriage - (a) and (b) combined - Control group with no particular intervention	Bangladesh (2008–2013)	19,060 women in 446 communities Age: 10–19	RCT	Financial incentive: - Reduced the likelihood of teenage childbearing by 14 per cent. Empowerment programme and combined treatments: - No effect on childbearing

Note: CCT = conditional cash transfer, DiD = difference-in-difference, IV = instrumental variable, RCT = randomized controlled trial, RD = regression discontinuity design, UCT = unconditional cash transfer.

Source: The above-mentioned studies, as well as the authors' interpretation of these studies.

studies suggest that it is possible to influence knowledge and attitudes, but that inducing changes in sexual behaviour and reducing early pregnancies are much more difficult, in line with what is argued in an overview article by Gallant & Maticka-Tyndale (2004).

2.1.1. KNOWLEDGE AND ATTITUDES

Several studies report a positive impact on knowledge and attitudes. The HIV prevention programme in Mongolian secondary schools (Cartagena et al. 2006) made students more knowledgeable with regard to HIV and sexual health; the information campaign in Nigeria increased reported knowledge about STIs, condom use, and treatment-seeking behaviour (Okonofua et al. 2003); the health education project in Tanzania (Doyle et al. 2010; Ross et al. 2007) had a significant impact on the participants' health knowledge; a cluster RCT offering an HIV-prevention course in Mexico improved knowledge about HIV (Walker et al. 2006); and students in Zambia who followed a peer education programme in secondary schools were more positive regarding the use of condoms and abstinence shortly after the programme (Agha & Van Rossem 2004).

2.1.2. SEXUAL BEHAVIOUR

Media-based reproductive health campaigns have proven effective in increasing women's contraceptive use, as shown in Cameroon, Botswana, South Africa, and Guinea (Agha 2002). Similar results were found from a multimedia campaign in Zimbabwe, where young people in campaign areas were much more likely to report saying no to sex, to visit a health centre, and to use contraceptives (Kim et al. 2001). An information campaign in Nigeria also increased condom use, awareness that the partner had an STD, and STD treatment-seeking behaviour (Okonofua et al. 2003). In South Africa, R. Magnani et al. (2005) used an instrumental variables approach to estimate the impacts of a life skills education programme in middle and secondary schools. They report significant increases in condom use at first and last sex. The PRACHAR Project in Bihar (India) also increased the demand for and use of contraceptives through communication interventions (Daniel et al. 2008).

There are, however, several studies with less positive findings. In their evaluation of a sexual education programme in Jamaica, Eggleston et al. (2000) do not find significant impacts on contraceptive use after one year. In Brazil, a combination of school-based sexual education and youth-friendly health services did not affect reported sexual behaviours or contraceptive use (R. J. Magnani et al. 2001). A sexual education intervention in secondary

schools in Zambia did not cause significant changes in condom use (Agha & Van Rossem 2004). Lou et al. (2004) base their report on an intervention that promotes contraception use among unmarried youths in Shanghai by building awareness and offering counselling and services related to sexuality and reproduction. They find a large, positive impact on contraception use shortly after the programme, but the effect vanishes three years later (Tu et al. 2008).

In Mongolia, Cartagena et al. (2006) evaluate the results of an HIVprevention programme in secondary schools. Four years after the programme, they found no clear impact on (reported) safe sex practices. In Mexico, Walker et al. (2006) report from a cluster randomized trial with three groups, undergoing an HIV-prevention course with promotion of condom use, the same course including emergency contraception as a back-up, and the existing sexual education course. Reported condom use and sexual behaviour were similar in all groups. In another randomized trial, Ross et al. (2007) document the effects of a health education project in Tanzania with four components: community activities; teacher-led, peer-assisted sexual health education in primary schools; training and supervision of health workers to provide 'youth-friendly' sexual health services; and condom marketing. They observe a significant impact on reported STI symptoms, but not on biological outcomes. The follow-up study did not find significant impacts on reported sexual behaviours. Finally, in a randomized experiment involving 328 schools in Kenya, Dupas (2011) compares two groups: a control group in which the students received the standard national HIV curriculum; and a treatment group in which the students received information on the relative risk of HIV infection by partner's age and gender. Compared with the control group, the treatment group reported increased sexual activity (but reduced risky sex). The study further suggests that girls moved away from older partners and toward younger partners.

2.1.3. PREGNANCY

Cabezón et al. (2005) evaluate an abstinence-centred sex-education programme (TeenSTAR) in a Chilean high school in the mid-1990s. They randomized the programme within student cohorts, and followed the students for four years. They report a very large reduction in pregnancy rates: from 18.9 per cent to 3.3 per cent in the 1997 cohort and from 22.6 per cent to 4.4 per cent in the 1998 cohort.

Dupas (2011) found that the HIV risk treatment decreased the likelihood that girls started childbearing within a year by 28 per cent compared to the control group, while the abstinence programme had no impact. An additional important finding is that the treatment also increased reported sexual activity

(but reduced risky sex). The study further suggests that girls moved away from older partners and toward younger partners.

Interestingly, Dupas et al. (2017) report from a similar experiment in Cameroon, where they compared a control group with groups (i) undergoing a one-hour HIV prevention session delivered by external consultants, (ii) undergoing the same one-hour session with additional information about the relative risk of HIV infection by partner's age, (iii) completing a one-hour self-administered HIV questionnaire, and (iv) following a classical HIV curriculum with their teacher. All treatments in this study reduced teen pregnancy by around 25 per cent.

In contrast to these positive findings, Doyle et al. (2010) report from a randomized intervention that provided sexual and reproductive health information, combined with 'youth-friendly' health services and subsidized condoms, in Tanzania. They do not find any impact on pregnancies or other sexual behaviours, despite strong improvements in knowledge. Similarly, Duflo et al. (2015), in Kenya, do not find any evidence of an impact on early pregnancy (or STIs) of an HIV curriculum stressing abstinence until marriage.

2.2. Expanding Economic Opportunities

During the last few decades, there has been a rise in interventions primarily aimed at changing economic opportunities in several development domains, including reproductive health. Interventions range from various cash-transfer schemes, conditioned, or not, on school enrolment and medical testing, to entrepreneurship or vocational training programmes.

There is limited evidence on the extent to which expanding economic opportunities also affects the mindset dimension, for instance in terms of locus of control. This may be important, since a change in the mindset has the potential to create a more durable effect from the intervention, going beyond the period of subsidies or training. We address this issue in the second part of this chapter, where we report from our ongoing study in Tanzania. Here, we limit ourselves to studying the impact on sexual behaviour and pregnancy. The overall impression is that the expansion of economic opportunities, particularly through financial incentives, can be effective, but that programme design matters.

2.2.1. SEXUAL BEHAVIOUR

Feldman et al. (2009) evaluate the effect of the conditional cash transfer (CCT) programme Oportunidades in Mexico, where the transfer was tied to regular health check-ups and school attendance, and report short-term,

but no long-term, effects on contraceptive use. De Walque et al. (2012) study a randomized CCT programme where treated participants were eligible to receive a cash transfer if they tested negative for curable STIs. They compare high- and low-value transfers and find that that the high-value transfers reduced STI prevalence, measured by biomedical tests. Finally, Handa et al. (2014) report that a UCT of US\$20 per month in Kenya lead to a significant postponement in the age of sexual debut.

2.2.2. PREGNANCY

Several studies find that interventions that change economic incentives affect early pregnancies. In Pakistan, Alam et al. (2011) studied female-targeted cash transfers in the form of school stipends, where the transfer was made conditional on a minimum school attendance of 80 per cent. They find increased school enrolment among eligible girls, which appears to have caused fewer teenage births and delayed marriage.

In their evaluation of the Zomba cash transfer programme for school attendance in Malawi, Baird et al. (2010) find large reductions in teenage pregnancy, early marriage, and self-reported sexual activity. In this study, school attendance was the only condition for the transfer, and the transfer as such was given in part to the student and in part to her guardian. In another experiment in Malawi, Baird et al. (2011) compare a CCT on school attendance with a UCT and a control group. Compared with the control group and the CCT, the UCT reduced the proportion of ever-pregnant women by 6.7 percentage points. They further show that the UCT effect comes from the girls who dropped out of school.

In India, another type of intervention had a large and significant impact on childbearing: it consisted of three years of recruiting services to help young women in randomly selected rural villages to get jobs in the business process outsourcing industry. Jensen (2012) finds that the intervention reduced the likelihood of getting married or giving birth over the three-year period by 5–6 percentage points. In the same vein, Heath & Mobarak (2015) report that the expansion of the garment industry in Bangladesh in the 1980s and 1990s pushed women to pursue further education and delayed marriage and childbearing.

Some studies do not find evidence that economic incentives reduce early pregnancies. Stecklov et al. (2007) evaluate the impact on fertility of the Oportunidades programme in Mexico as well as similar programmes in Nicaragua and Honduras, and do not find any impact on fertility of the programmes in Mexico or Nicaragua, and, surprisingly, an increase in fertility by 2 to 4 percentage points in Honduras. The authors argue that the increased fertility in Honduras could be due to the fact that eligibility for the programme

required the household to include a pregnant woman or a child below three years old.

2.3. Combined Treatments: Changing the Mindset and Expanding Economic Opportunities

We have identified four studies that clearly target both mindset and economic opportunities. First, Duflo et al. (2015), in an RCT involving 328 schools in Kenya, compare the effects of (i) education subsidies (free uniforms), (ii) an HIV curriculum stressing abstinence, and (iii) both interventions combined. While the HIV curriculum had no impact, the education subsidy significantly reduced the teenage pregnancy rate, from 16 per cent to 13 per cent. Surprisingly, however, when the two programmes were implemented jointly, the pregnancy rate fell less than with the subsidy alone. The authors report that the HIV prevention curriculum, which focuses on an abstinence-until-marriage message, in fact increased early marriage. The effect of earlier marriage therefore probably counteracted the positive opportunity effect from the education subsidies on childbearing.

Second, Buchmann et al. (2016) set up an RCT clustered by communities in rural Bangladesh. They compare a control group with (i) an empowerment programme, (ii) a financial payment conditional on marriage delay, and (iii) the combination of the two. More than four years after treatment, they find that the girls in the conditional payment group are 14 per cent less likely to have given birth before the age of 20. On the other hand, the empowerment programme has no separate or additional effect.

Finally, Bandiera et al. (2015), in Uganda, and Buehren et al. (2015), in Tanzania, evaluate an out-of-school adolescent club organized by BRAC, which provided both health training (life skills) (affecting mindset), entrepreneurship training, including training of vocational skills (affecting economic opportunities), and a safe social space for the girls to gather and socialize. Bandiera et al. (2015) find a sharp increase in the participants' incomes and consumption after a two-year period, and correspondingly substantial reductions in rates of childbearing and marriage or cohabitation. The intervention also raised the likelihood of the girls engaging in income-generating activities by 72 per cent, while early pregnancy fell by 26 per cent. The study thus suggests that acting on both the mindset and opportunities fronts may be very effective. On the other hand, Buehren et al. (2015) do not find significant impacts in Tanzania, which they ascribe to challenges related to the implementation of the programme. These studies are, however, not able to disentangle the effects caused by the different parts of the programme. Our project in Tanzania, to which we shall shortly turn, is designed to address exactly that question.

2.4. Overall Remarks on the Literature

In evaluating the impact of interventions targeting early pregnancies and risky sexual behaviour, the literature has largely relied on self-reported measures of pregnancies, sexual behaviour, knowledge, and attitudes, with a few exceptions measuring biological outcomes. The overall picture is mixed, but, perhaps not surprisingly, it is easier to foster changes in knowledge and attitudes than in sexual behaviour and pregnancies. Still, the more recent trend focusing on the expansion of economic opportunities shows a lot of promise, with several evaluations documenting sustained improvements in behaviour and reductions in early pregnancies. This may indicate that lack of opportunities is a more binding constraint to healthy lives than lack of knowledge or other mindset variables.

3. New Evidence from Tanzania

To supplement the review of the literature, we provide a more detailed discussion of an ongoing research project in Tanzania that evaluates the impact of health training and entrepreneurship training for young females (Berge et al. 2016). The overall aim of this project is to study how different interventions, separately and in combination, may reduce early pregnancies by changing the girls' mindset and by providing them with economic opportunities. We do not yet have data on pregnancies, and thus our analysis will focus on the intermediate question of whether, in the short term, these interventions managed to empower the girls. In this respect, we focus on how the interventions affect the participants' *mindset*, in the form of *locus of control* and *sexual discourse*, and perceived future economic *opportunities*, in the form of business plans.

We focus on locus of control because it is commonly used as a measure of girls' control over their body and sexuality. Individuals with an internal locus of control expect things in their lives to happen because of their own efforts, skills, and ability rather than through external factors such as luck or fate (Rotter 1966). It has also been argued that people with more locus of control are more likely to engage and succeed in entrepreneurial activities, as they have a more positive outlook towards life, they are more likely to take action, and are more persistent (Rauch and Frese 2007). Arguably, therefore, strengthening the locus of control can be important for improving both health and

⁵ See, for instance, the ongoing research 'Negotiating a Better Future: The Impact of Teaching Negotiation Skills on Girls' Health and Educational Outcomes' led by Nava Ashraf, Corinne Low, and Kathleen McGinn, available at http://www.poverty-action.org/study/negotiating-better-future-impact-teaching-negotiation-skills-girls-health-and-educational (accessed 1 June 2017).

economic outcomes of adolescent girls, including delaying first pregnancy. At the same time, for an increase in locus of control to actually initiate changes in health and economic behaviour, the girls need knowledge about what represents risky sexual behaviour and economic opportunities that allow them to choose differently. Hence, targeting early pregnancies involves tackling an intricate set of relationships involving different mindset variables, including knowledge, and opportunities.

The following discussion aims to illustrate an alternative approach to evaluating this type of intervention, by showing how the use of the textual analysis of essays written by the girls can shed light on underlying mechanisms and supplement more traditional survey approaches.

3.1. The Study Design

We sampled eighty schools with at least twenty girls in the last year of secondary school (Form IV) in the regions of Tabora, Singida, Morogoro, and Dodoma in Tanzania, reaching almost 3,500 girls. The baseline data were collected in April–May 2013, and the follow-up with the essay writing in October–November 2013. The schools are all public (i.e. state) schools. They have on average sixty girls registered in Form IV, but only forty-three regularly attending. The girls mostly live in rural areas and were in the age range 16–18 at baseline, which is the age group for which we observe a sharp increase in fertility in rural Tanzania.

The average household of the girls consists of six members, and 20 per cent of households are headed by a woman. Half of the heads of households are farmers, the others either self-employed or public servants. At baseline, the majority declared that girls of their age typically have had their sexual debut. Eighty per cent also agreed with the statement 'Girls of my age sometimes receive money or gifts for having sex with older men', and 60 per cent declared that the girls of their age are often sexually harassed. Most of them knew other girls who had dropped out of school because they were pregnant. Their knowledge of reproductive health was limited: one-third thought that it is not possible to get pregnant from a first sexual intercourse.

Among the schools in our study, we randomly allocated twenty schools to entrepreneurship training, twenty schools to health training, twenty schools to receive both entrepreneurship and health training, and twenty schools to control. Two teachers per school in the treatment groups attended an instructor session organized by our local partner, the non-governmental organization, Femina Hip. After these instructor sessions, in July–September 2013, the teachers implemented the training sessions with all the Form IV girls in their schools. Both the health training and the entrepreneurship training involved eight weekly training sessions of 1.5 to 2 hours, while those who got

both types of training had two sessions per week over the eight weeks. The entrepreneurship programme trained the girls in customer care, marketing, record-keeping, pricing of products, and personal finance, and they were challenged to develop an entrepreneurial mindset and strengthen their self-confidence. The health programme provided information and guidance about contraception and the consequences of risky sexual behaviour, as well as gender equality.

3.2. Text Analysis of Essays

A few weeks after the completion of the training programmes, we asked the girls to write a short essay about where they envisioned themselves in five to ten years' time in terms of education, livelihood, marriage, and the challenges they expected to face.⁶

To shed light on how the intervention shaped the girls' ambitions and visions, we report from two types of text analysis, one in-depth and the other based on a word count. For the in-depth analysis, we translated 192 essays, written by girls from four schools in the Morogoro region, from Swahili to English. The remaining essays were digitized and used for the word-count analysis so as to reveal the occurrence of words relating to locus of control and business plans.

The strength of the in-depth analysis of the text, compared with the word count, is that it provides a more nuanced and reliable categorization of the essays. The strength of the word count is that it can be more easily implemented on a large scale. As we show below, the results are robust to the choice of method.

In the in-depth analysis, along the locus of control dimension, we assign a score of 1 to essays that reveal a strong sense of locus of control through the use of positive words such as 'I am confident' and 'I am capable'. In contrast, essays that have no positive words or have negative words such as 'I will not make it' are assigned a score of 0 and are considered neutral.

For the word count text analysis, we first digitized the full sample of 3,128 hand-written essays, manually typing them into Microsoft Word documents. The documents were then converted and imported into Stata 14 for processing. All the analysis was done in the original language, Swahili, but we provide an English translation of the words used in this chapter.

⁶ One may of course worry that the participants report what they believe the researchers want to hear. The risk of such reporting bias applies to all studies based on self-reported information. One could argue, however, that essays are less prone to this bias than specific survey questions, since it is less clear what exactly the surveyor would like the respondent to put in the essay.

The essays contained a total of 475,089 words. We removed all uninformative words (such as 'and', 'they', 'a'...) as well as punctuation (',',',','!'...). Finally, we removed all words that appeared fewer than thirty times in total. After this trimming, we were left with 112,648 words. These are the data that we use in the text analysis.

We scanned all the unique words and decided which ones should be included in each index:

- The general business index is equal to 1 if the essay contains the following words (and their variations): *business, entrepreneur, establish, self-employed, entrepreneurship*.
- The specific business index is equal to 1 if the essay contains the following words (and their variations): *funds, capital, sell, goods, shop, profit, gain, savings, customers, products, vegetable, sewing machine, poultry, fruit.*
- The locus of control index is equal to 1 if the essay contains the following words (and their variations): *I can, extrovert, confidence, independent, focus, toward the goal, I blossomed, opportunities, respect, self-respect.*
- The sexuality index is equal to 1 if the essay contains the following words (and their variations): *baby, maternity, love, sex*.

3.2.1. TEXT ANALYSIS: LOCUS OF CONTROL

In the in-depth analysis, we observe that the girls in the entrepreneurship training group appear to have the highest number of essays (49 per cent: an impact of 0.33, standard error = 0.1) with a score of one on the locus of control index, indicating a strong sense of control. The proportion is of 33 per cent in the health training group (impact = 0.17, standard error = 0.09) and of 35 per cent in the combined treatment (impact = 0.19, standard error = 0.09). The control group has the lowest proportion: 16 per cent of their essays show a strong locus of control. In the entrepreneurship training group, most of the girls appear to be confident in their essays and optimistic about the future with the use of words such as 'I am capable' and 'I believe that I will succeed'. In contrast, in the control group, most of the essays are neutral and there is no use of positive or affirming words.

By using the word counts on the full sample of essays, we gain a very consistent picture, with all treatment groups showing a greater sense of *locus of control*. Both the health and the combined interventions have the same impact on the locus of control index, which is equal to 0.06 (standard error = 0.03). The entrepreneurship training has an impact of 0.09 (standard error = 0.02).

 $^{^{7}\,}$ The impact is measured by an ordinary least square estimation where we regress the indices on a dummy for each treatment group.

3.2.2. TEXT ANALYSIS: SEXUALITY

In terms of the sexuality index, we find that 42 per cent of the girls in the control group include words about sex in their essay, the proportion rises to 47 per cent in the health treatment group (impact = 0.05, standard error = 0.03), decreases to 38 per cent in the entrepreneurship training treatment group (impact of -0.04, standard error = 0.02), and it barely changes in the combined treatment group. This suggests that the health treated have integrated in their essays the sexual issues discussed in the training, while it appears that the entrepreneurship training made the girls less focused on sexuality issues. Interestingly, we observe that the two effects cancel each other out in the combined treatment.⁸

3.2.3. TEXT ANALYSIS: BUSINESS PLANS

We categorize, and distinguish between, essays mentioning business plans in general terms and those with more specific or detailed business plans. A business plan is regarded as general when there is mention of starting a business but no precision about the type of business. For instance, the statement 'In the future I would like to have my own business that will provide me with income' was categorized as a general business plan. On the other hand, the statement 'I will start a business selling vegetables' was regarded as a specific business plan. The rationale behind the distinction between general and specific business plans is to separate girls who have thought more carefully about setting up a business, for instance as a result of the entrepreneurship training, and those who have only vague ideas about their business future. Potentially, those with more developed business ideas are also more likely to set up a business once out of school.

Girls in control schools do mention business plans in their essays (11 per cent in the in-depth analysis and 32 per cent in the word count). Compared to them, the entrepreneurship training yielded more essays in which general business plans for the future are mentioned (in-depth analysis: impact = 0.67, standard error = 0.1; word count: impact = 0.34, standard error = 0.02). Interestingly, compared with the control group, the health group also has a much larger number of essays mentioning business plans, even though this group did not receive any form of entrepreneurship training (in-depth analysis: impact = 0.36, standard error = 0.09; word count: impact = 0.06, standard error = 0.02). This could be due to a general empowerment and mindset effect from the health training, as suggested by the increased sense of locus of control shown above. The combined training led to effects similar to those of the

⁸ We do not have an in-depth analysis for the *sexuality* content.

entrepreneurship training (in-depth analysis: impact = 0.5, standard error = 0.09; word count: impact = 0.27, standard error = 0.02).

When we consider only specific business plans, we find that both the entrepreneurship and the combined training had similar effects. The effects of the health training however dissipate. In the in-depth analysis, we do not observe any control essay with specific plans. In the word count, 25 per cent of the control essays include some specific business plans. The treatment impact of the entrepreneurship training is equal to 0.35 (standard error=0.08, in-depth analysis) and 0.16 (standard error=0.02, word count). The combined training has an impact of 0.2 (standard error=0.07, in-depth analysis) and 0.1 (standard error=0.02, word count). The health training has an impact of 0.16 (standard error=0.07) in the in-depth analysis, but no significant impact in the word count (impact=-0.02, standard error=0.02).

3.3. Text Analysis: Overall Findings

We observe that the girls who have been in different treatment groups have very different hopes for the future. Compared with the control, the health group treated express a much higher sense of *locus of control* and are more likely to discuss *issues of sexuality*. On the other hand, only those who received the entrepreneurship training (the single treatment or together with health) mention clear, specific, *business plans*. Participants in the entrepreneurship training also demonstrate a greater sense of *locus of control*, but they mention *sexuality* issues to a lesser extent than people in the control group and in the health training.

If the delaying of pregnancies requires changes in both mindset (preferences and beliefs relating to sexual activity, pregnancy, and their consequences) and economic opportunities (economic alternatives to early marriage and mother-hood), our findings suggest that entrepreneurship training, alone or in combination with health training, is more effective than health training alone. The long-run follow-up data in this project, which will contain information on pregnancy, will establish whether this actually is the case.

4. Conclusion

Early pregnancies are associated with negative effects on young women's health outcomes, educational attainment, and future employment and economic opportunities. Interventions to reduce this problem typically target the young women's mindset, through educational programmes about reproductive health and family planning. In addition, interventions have targeted

economic opportunities through cash transfers and, more recently, through entrepreneurship or vocational training.

The literature on interventions targeting the mindset dimension shows that success cannot be taken for granted. While such programmes typically manage to improve knowledge and change attitudes, the impact on pregnancies and sexual behaviour is rather mixed. One reason why changes in mindset do not necessarily result in changes in outcomes could be the lack of economic alternatives. If entering into a relationship with an older man is the only economically viable path to making a living, then changing the mindset is likely not to achieve much.

This is why interventions that seek to expand economic opportunities for adolescent girls are a promising policy agenda. Indeed, during the last few decades, there has been a surge in such interventions, ranging from conditional cash transfers to entrepreneurship training programmes. Again, the evidence on the effectiveness of such programmes to reduce early pregnancy and change sexual behaviour is rather mixed, and some of the positive impacts have proven to be short-lived. One possible reason why expanding economic opportunities does not necessarily lead to lasting changes in outcomes is that such changes may need to be combined with a change in girls' mindsets, including awareness of the risks involved in sexual activities. The opportunities must be there but the girls also need the mindset to seize them.

A few studies consider the impact of interventions that target both mindset and economic opportunities, and the results are encouraging. Given the complexity of such interventions, however, we do not know enough about the mechanisms of change. Do programmes such as youth clubs in Uganda, evaluated by Bandiera et al. (2015) and found to be highly successful in reducing early pregnancy, primarily work through a mindset change or through increasing economic opportunities? Or is there some other channel, such as providing girls with a safe space in which to socialize?

Our analysis of essays written by more than three thousand girls in rural Tanzania addresses the question of the mechanism of change. It indicates that training in both health (targeting the mindset) and entrepreneurship (targeting economic opportunities) has had an impact on the girls' sense of locus of control. Also, the entrepreneurship programme has been successful in stimulating new business plans, which can be seen as a first step towards economic empowerment. Our findings may thus contribute to explaining why economic interventions may be more successful than pure health interventions, since the entrepreneurship training appears to affect both the mindset and economic opportunities. This is an ongoing project, however, and we do not yet have evidence on how the intervention in the end affected pregnancy.

More work is needed in order to understand what types of intervention are more effective in reducing early pregnancies in developing countries, and how to understand the mechanism of change. We hope many researchers will join us in pursuing these promising and important avenues for future research in the coming years.

References

- Agha, S. (2002). 'A Quasi-Experimental Study to Assess the Impact of Four Adolescent Sexual Health Interventions in Sub-Saharan Africa'. *International Family Planning Perspectives*, 28(2): 67. https://doi.org/10.2307/3088237
- Agha, S., and Van Rossem, R. (2004). 'Impact of a School-based Peer Sexual Health Intervention on Normative Beliefs, Risk Perceptions, and Sexual Behavior of Zambian Adolescents'. *Journal of Adolescent Health*, 34: 441–52. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jadohealth.2003.07.016
- Alam, A., J. E. Baez, and X. V. Del Carpio (2011). 'Does Cash for School Influence Young Women's Behavior in the Longer Term? Evidence from Pakistan' (Policy Research Working Paper No. 5669). Retrieved from http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/996441468145471110/pdf/WPS5669.pdf
- Bailey, M. J. (2006). 'More Power to the Pill: The Impact of Contraceptive Freedom on Women's Life Cycle Labor Supply'. *The Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 121(1): 289–320. https://doi.org/10.1093/qje/121.1.289
- Baird, S., E. Chirwa, C. McIntosh, and B. Özler (2010). 'The Short-Term Impacts of a Schooling Conditional Cash Transfer Program on the Sexual Behavior of Young Women'. *Health Economics*, 19(S1): 55–68. https://doi.org/10.1002/hec.1569
- Baird, S., C., McIntosh, and B. Özler (2011). 'Cash or Condition? Evidence from a Cash Transfer Experiment'. *The Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 126(4): 1709–53. https://doi.org/10.1093/qje/qjr032
- Bandiera, O., N. Buehren, R. Burgess, M. Goldstein, S. Gulesci, I. Rasul, and M. Sulaiman (2015). 'Women's Empowerment in Action: Evidence from a Randomized Control Trial in Africa'. Retrieved from http://www.ucl.ac.uk/~uctpimr/research/ELA.pdf
- Berge, L. I. O., K. Bjorvatn, F. Makene, L. Helgesson Sekei, V. Somville, and B. Tungodden (2018). 'Women's Economic Empowerment and Fertility: Long-Term Experimental Evidence from Tanzania' (unpublished).
- Buchmann, N., E. Field, R. Glennerster, and S. Nazneen (2016). 'The Effect of Conditional Incentives and a Girls' Empowerment Curriculum on Adolescent Marriage, Childbearing and Education in Rural Bangladesh: A Community Clustered Randomized Controlled Trial' (unpublished), 1–37.
- Buehren, N., M. Goldstein, S. Gulesci, M. Sulaiman, and V. Yam (2015). 'Evaluation of Layering Microfinance on an Adolescent Development Program for Girls in Tanzania' (unpublished).

- Cabezón, C., P. Vigil, I. Rojas, M. E. Leiva, R. Riquelme, W. Aranda, et al. (2005). 'Adolescent Pregnancy Prevention: An Abstinence-Centered Randomized Controlled Intervention in a Chilean Public High School'. *The Journal of Adolescent Health: Official Publication of the Society for Adolescent Medicine*, 36(1): 64–9. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jadohealth.2003.10.011
- Cartagena, R. G., P. J. Veugelers, W. Kipp, K. Magigav, and L. M. Laing (2006). 'Effectiveness of an HIV Prevention Program for Secondary School Students in Mongolia'. *Journal of Adolescent Health*, 39(6): 925.e9–925.e16. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jadohealth.2006.07.017
- Daniel, E. E., R. Masilamani, and M. Rahman (2008). 'The Effect of Community-Based Reproductive Health Communication Interventions on Contraceptive Use Among Young Married Couples in Bihar, India'. *International Family Planning Perspectives*, 34(4): 189–97. https://doi.org/10.1363/ifpp.34.189.08
- De Walque, D., W. H., Dow, R., Nathan, R., Abdul, F., Abilahi, E., Gong, and C. A. Medlin (2012). 'Incentivising Safe Sex: A Randomised Trial of Conditional Cash Transfers for HIV and Sexually Transmitted Infection Prevention in Rural Tanzania. *BMJ Open*, 2(1): e000747. https://doi.org/10.1136/bmjopen-2011-000747
- Doyle, A. M., D. A. Ross, K. Maganja, K. Baisley, C. Masesa, A. Andreasen and MEMA kwa Vijana Trial Study Group (2010). 'Long-Term Biological and Behavioural Impact of an Adolescent Sexual Health Intervention in Tanzania: Follow-up Survey of the Community-Based MEMA kwa Vijana Trial'. *PLoS Medicine*, 7(6): e1000287. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pmed.1000287
- Duflo, E., P. Dupas, and M. Kremer (2015). 'Education, HIV, and Early Fertility: Experimental Evidence from Kenya'. *American Economic Review*, 105(9): 2757–97. https://doi.org/10.1257/aer.20121607
- Dupas, P. (2011). 'Do Teenagers Respond to HIV Risk Information? Evidence from a Field Experiment in Kenya'. *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics*, 3(1): 1–34. https://doi.org/10.1257/app.3.1.1
- Dupas, P., E. Huillery, and J. Seban (2017). 'Risk Information, Risk Salience, and Adolescent Sexual Behavior: Experimental Evidence from Cameroon', *Journal of Economic Behavior & Organization* 145: 151–75. January 2018, https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0167268117302810
- Eggleston, E., J. Jackson, W. Rountree, and Z. Pan (2000). 'Evaluation of a Sexuality Education Program for Young Adolescents in Jamaica'. *Pan American Journal of Public Health*, 7(2): 102–12. Retrieved from http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/10748661
- Feldman, B. S., A. M. Zaslavsky, M. Ezzati, K. E. Peterson, and M. Mitchell (2009). 'Contraceptive Use, Birth Spacing, and Autonomy: An Analysis of the Oportunidades Program in Rural Mexico'. *Studies in Family Planning*, 40(1): 51–62. Retrieved from http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/19397185
- Gallant, M., and E. Maticka-Tyndale (2004). 'School-Based HIV Prevention Programmes for African Youth'. *Social Science & Medicine*, 58(7): 1337–51. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0277-9536(03)00331-9
- Goldin, C., and L. F. Katz (2002). 'The Power of the Pill: Oral Contraceptives and Women's Career and Marriage Decisions'. *Journal of Political Economy*, 110(4): 730–70. Retrieved from http://ideas.repec.org/a/ucp/jpolec/v110y2002i4p730-770.html

- Handa, S., C. T. Halpern, A. Pettifor, and H. Thirumurthy (2014). 'The Government of Kenya's Cash Transfer Program Reduces the Risk of Sexual Debut among Young People Age 15–25. *PLoS ONE*, 9(1): e85473. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone. 0085473
- Heath, R., and A. M. Mobarak (2015). 'Manufacturing Growth and the Lives of Bangladeshi Women'. *Journal of Development Economics*, 115: 1–15. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jdeveco.2015.01.006
- Jensen, R. (2012). 'Do Labor Market Opportunities Affect Young Women's Work and Family Decisions? Experimental Evidence from India'. The Quarterly Journal of Economics, 127(2): 753–92. https://doi.org/10.1093/qje/qjs002
- Kim, Y. M., A., Kols, R. Nyakauru, C. Marangwanda, and P. Chibatamoto (2001). 'Promoting Sexual Responsibility among Young People in Zimbabwe'. *International Family Planning Perspectives*, 27(1): 11. https://doi.org/10.2307/2673800
- Lou, C.-H., B. Wang, Y. Shen, and E.-S. Gao (2004). 'Effects of a Community-Based Sex Education and Reproductive Health Service Program on Contraceptive Use of Unmarried Youths in Shanghai'. *Journal of Adolescent Health*, 34(5): 433–40. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jadohealth.2003.07.020
- Magnani, R. J., L. Gaffikin, E. M. de Aquino, E. E. Seiber, M. C. Almeida, and V. Lipovsek (2001). 'Impact of an Integrated Adolescent Reproductive Health Program in Brazil'. *Studies in Family Planning*, 32(3): 230–43. Retrieved from http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih. gov/pubmed/11686184
- Magnani, R., K. MacIntyre, A. M. Karim, L. Brown, and P. Hutchinson (2005). 'The Impact of Life Skills Education on Adolescent Sexual Risk Behaviors in KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa'. *Journal of Adolescent Health*, 36: 289–304.
- Miller, G. (2010). 'Contraception as Development? New Evidence from Family Planning in Colombia'. *Economic Journal*, 120 (545): 709–36.
- Okonofua, F. E., P. Coplan, S. Collins, F. Oronsaye, D. Ogunsakin, J. T. Ogonor and K. Heggenhougen (2003). 'Impact of an Intervention to Improve Treatment-Seeking Behavior and Prevent Sexually Transmitted Diseases Among Nigerian Youths'. *International Journal of Infectious Diseases*, 7(1): 61–73. https://doi.org/10.1016/S1201-9712(03)90044-0
- Oringanje, C., M. M. Meremikwu, H. Eko, E. Esu, A. Meremikwu, and J. E Ehiri (2016). 'Interventions for Preventing Unintended Pregnancies Among Adolescents'. In C. Oringanje (ed.) *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*. Chichester, UK: John Wiley & Sons, Ltd. https://doi.org/10.1002/14651858.CD005215.pub3
- Rasul, I. (2008). 'Household Bargaining Over Fertility: Theory and Evidence from Malaysia'. *Journal of Development Economics*, 86(2): 215–41. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jdeveco.2007.02.005
- Rauch, A., and M. Frese (2007). 'Let's Put the Person Back into Entrepreneurship Research: A Meta-Analysis on the Relationship Between Business Owners' Personality Traits, Business Creation and Success'. *European Journal of Work and Organizational Psychology* 16: 353–85.
- Ross, D.A., J. Changalucha, A.I. Obasi et al. (2007). 'Biological and Behavioral Impact of an Adolescent Sexual Health Intervention in Tanzania: A Community-Randomized Trial'. AIDS, 21: 1943–55.

Towards Gender Equity in Development

- Rotter, J. B. (1966). 'Generalized Expectancies for Internal Versus External Control of Reinforcement'. *Psychological Monographs*, 80(1): 1–28. Retrieved from http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/5340840.
- Stecklov, G., P. Winters, J. Todd, and F. Regalia (2007). 'Unintended Effects of Poverty Programmes on Childbearing in Less Developed Countries: Experimental Evidence from Latin America'. *Population Studies*, 61(2): 125–40. https://doi.org/10.1080/00324720701300396.
- Tu, X., C. Lou, E. Gao, and I. H. Shah (2008). 'Long-Term Effects of a Community-Based Program on Contraceptive Use Among Sexually Active Unmarried Youth in Shanghai, China'. *Journal of Adolescent Health*, 42(3): 249–58. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jadohealth.2007.08.028.
- Walker, D., J. P. Gutierrez, P. Torres, and S. M. Bertozzi (2006). 'HIV Prevention in Mexican Schools: Prospective Randomised Evaluation of Intervention'. *BMJ*, 332(7551): 1189–94. https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.38796.457407.80.
- The World Bank (2012). World Development Report 2012—Gender Equality and Development. https://doi.org/10.1080/13552070512331332273.
- World Health Organization (2014). Adolescent Pregnancy. Retrieved 6 March 2017, from http://www.who.int/mediacentre/factsheets/fs364/en/#.WL0uYzXWtwY.email.